

1 **The use of non-*Brachionus plicatilis* species complex rotifer in larviculture**

2 Atsushi Hagiwara<sup>ab</sup>, Helen S. Marcial<sup>a</sup>

3 <sup>a</sup> Graduate School of Fisheries and Environmental Sciences

4 <sup>b</sup> Organization for Marine Science and Technology,

5 Nagasaki University, Nagasaki, Japan.

6 E-mail: hagiwara@nagasaki-u.ac.jp

7 Telephone number : +81-095-819-2830

8 Fax number: +81-095-819-2830

9 **Abstract**

10           Due to the expanding world aquaculture production, the demand for high quality and quantity of  
11 fish larvae has also increased. Up to date, the bottleneck in larviculture is the stable and ample production  
12 of appropriate live food such as rotifers and copepods. Among rotifers, *Brachionus plicatilis* species  
13 complex, which encompasses 15 species with varied sizes ranging from 100-400 µm, is commonly used  
14 in most hatcheries. The use of *B. plicatilis* species complex (*B. plicatilis*, *B. koreanus* and *B.*  
15 *rotundiformis*) in larviculture is reported in several review papers. In this review, we first described rotifer  
16 species not classified under *B. plicatilis* species complex, some of which are already used in larviculture,  
17 while some have high potential for use based on their characteristics, life history, and distribution.

18 Rotifers, *Brachionus angularis*, *Brachionus calyciflorus* and *Proales similis* are described in details in  
19 comparison with *B. plicatilis* species complex. Furthermore, we discussed some characteristics of rotifers  
20 which can affect their predation.

21 **Keywords:** Rotifera, live food, larval culture, rotifer mass culture, *Brachionus*, *Proales similis*

## 22 **Introduction**

23 Aquaculture is the world's fastest growing food producing sector, with an annual growth rate of  
24 8.8% compared to 1.2% for capture fisheries and 2.8% for terrestrial meat production (FAO, 2016).  
25 Parallel to the growth of aquaculture is the demand of high quality and quantity of larvae needed to be  
26 stocked in either cages or fish ponds. Although aquaculture had advanced this far, larviculture for most  
27 fishes is still dependent on live food such as rotifers, copepods, cladocerans, and *Artemia*, especially  
28 during the transition from endogenous to exogenous feeding. This is due to the fact that most fish larvae  
29 cannot readily assimilate formulated diets during the first days of feeding (Conceição et al., 2010). In  
30 addition, fish larvae are believed to be predominantly visual feeders, therefore preferably selecting  
31 moving prey items (Conceição et al., 2010).

32 Among live feed, rotifers (genus *Brachionus*) are ideal for larviculture because of their varied  
33 body size, their nutritional quality which can be controlled with commercial enrichment products, and  
34 their established culture techniques (Lubzens, 1987; Dhert et al., 2001; Hagiwara et al., 2017). The use of  
35 rotifer, *Brachionus plicatilis* species complex (which comprises approximately 15 species; Mills et al.  
36 2017), in larviculture is well established since its first usage as live food in the 1960s. Papakostas et al.  
37 (2006) found five species from hatcheries around the world. *Brachionus plicatilis* Muller, *Brachionus*  
38 *koreanus* Hwang, Dahms, Park & Lee and *Brachionus rotundiformis* Tschugunoff, corresponding to L, S,  
39 and SS morphotype, respectively (Hagiwara et al., 2007), are widely used, and their biological  
40 information is well examined. Production techniques of these species are already established and, due to  
41 their varied sizes, culturists can choose the rotifer species to use according to the mouth size of their  
42 cultured species, and are given to the fish larvae upon hatching up to 10-20 days after its mouth opening  
43 (Lubzens et al., 1987; Conceição et al., 2010). Thereafter, larvae are fed with larger live feed such as  
44 *Artemia*, copepods and cladocerans, or artificial formulated diet.

45           The demand for the ornamental fishes is always high (Lim et al., 2003; Whittington & Chong,  
46 2007). Most (about 90%) of the ornamental fish in the market are freshwater species and are farm-bred,  
47 while marine species are predominantly from the wild (Whittington & Chong, 2007). Therefore, the  
48 major goal of the aquaculture industry is to reduce collection pressure on wild populations by developing  
49 captive culture techniques of marine species (Majoris et al., 2018). At present, larviculture of marine fish  
50 species is usually done by using the so-called “green water technique” and feeding with small brachionid  
51 rotifers (e.g. *B. rotundiformis* with 150-190 µm in lorica length ) from hatching up to 14 days, or by  
52 raising the breeders in a fish pond where hatchlings can eat a variety of live food from the environment  
53 (Lim & Wong, 1997; Majoris et al., 2018). At commercial scale, ornamental marine fish species with a  
54 too small mouth size to ingest *B. rotundiformis* are either not cultured successfully or fed with inert food  
55 such as milk powder, egg yolk, and powder feeds (Lim et al., 2003; Hirai et al., 2012). Therefore, there is  
56 a high demand for rotifer species smaller than *B. rotundiformis* for the commercial production of  
57 ornamental fishes.

58           Culture of rotifers can either be done intensively or extensively. In intensive culture, rotifers are  
59 reared in a highly controlled environment, fed with condensed or concentrated food, and supplied with  
60 either aeration or pure oxygen. Under these conditions, culturists can produce as high as 2.1 billion of  
61 rotifers per day in 1 m<sup>3</sup> culture volume (Hagiwara et al., 2017). Although this procedure produces high  
62 quality and quantity of rotifers, it also entails skills and high costs. On the other hand, in extensive  
63 culture, rotifers are grown in a fish pond and animal manures/excreta are supplied to promote plankton  
64 productivity (Dahril, 1997; Agbakimi et al., 2017). Animal excreta enter the food web in the pond through  
65 direct consumption by phytoplankton. These wastes also serve as source of minerals and organic  
66 substrates for heterotrophic microorganisms. Phytoplankton and microorganisms are, in turn, consumed  
67 by zooplanktons (including rotifers). In this practice, however, the environmental factors that would affect  
68 the growth of rotifers, such as temperature, pH, and ammonia concentration, are difficult to control. In  
69 addition, rotifer density in the pond is relatively low, probably due to competition with other zooplankton

70 with the same food or due to predation by other rotifers. Therefore, although extensive aquaculture has  
71 lower operating costs and easier management, this method was found to be not effective for mass  
72 production of larval fish in terms of labor cost and space.

73 High population growth, appropriate size, ubiquitous distribution, and ease of culture are among  
74 the most important qualities of a rotifer species to be considered as a good candidate for use in  
75 commercial hatcheries. Therefore, research efforts are being directed into finding rotifer species with  
76 these characteristics.

77 In this review, we described non-*B. plicatilis* species which are already used in larviculture, in  
78 comparison to *B. plicatilis* species complex. Next, we listed some of the species with high potential for  
79 usage for larviculture based on their characteristics, life history, and distribution. Third, we discussed  
80 some characteristics of rotifers which can affect their predation.

81

## 82 ***Brachionus plicatilis* sp. complex**

83 *B. plicatilis*, *B. koreanus* and *B. rotundiformis*

84 The euryhaline rotifer *B. plicatilis* species complex, which encompasses around 15 species with  
85 varied sizes ranging from 100-400  $\mu\text{m}$  (Mills et al., 2017), is the most common species used in marine  
86 fish hatcheries worldwide. Their culture techniques and usage as live food are well known and reviewed  
87 by several authors (*e.g.* Dhert et al., 2001; Conceição et al., 2010; Sakakura, 2017; Hagiwara et al., 2017).  
88 With several modifications through the years of experimentation, a stable, reliable, economical and  
89 continuous culture system which can produce up to 2.1 billion of rotifers in 1  $\text{m}^3$  culture volume on daily  
90 basis have been produced (Hagiwara et al., 2017). The highest density obtained for these species  
91 complex was 160,000 ind/ml (Yoshimura et al., 2003; Yoshimatsu & Hossain, 2014).

92 Reproductive characteristics of *B. plicatilis* species complex in comparison to other rotifer  
93 species that are currently used in aquaculture are presented in Table 1. Because of changes in taxonomy  
94 of this group, S-morphotype species such as *Brachionus koreanus* was recognized as *B. rotundiformis* in  
95 some literatures (e.g. Yoshimura et al., 2003).

96 The importance of the *B. plicatilis* complex in larviculture is difficult to overestimate and  
97 reviewed by many authors (e.g. Lim et al., 2003; Conceição et al., 2010; Sakakura, 2017).

98

## 99 **Non-*Brachionus plicatilis* sp. complex**

### 100 *Species used in larviculture*

#### 101 1 ) *Brachionus angularis*

102 *Brachionus angularis* Gosse is a common freshwater species. Its body size ranges from 85 to 140  
103 mm; tropical species isolated from Kenya and Laos are smaller compared to those isolated from  
104 temperate countries (e.g. from Europe and China; Ogello et al., 2016; Ogata, 2017). *B. angularis* isolated  
105 from Laos has a round-shaped lorica, can reproduce both sexually and asexually, and lorica length of  
106 adult egg-carrying females has a size ( $86.0 \pm 4.9 \mu\text{m}$ ), smaller than that of other *B. angularis* and  
107 strains in *B. plicatilis* species complex (Ogata et al., 2011). Ogata et al. (2011) found that the optimum  
108 culture conditions for this strain include culture temperature between 24 to 27°C and feeding with  $7 \times 10^6$   
109 cells/ml of *Chlorella vulgaris* Beyerinck. At these culture conditions, they obtained rotifer density of  
110 more 2,000 ind/ml within 10 days. During their experiments, the highest density they obtained for this  
111 species was 3,300 ind/ml.

112 Ogata (2017) used *B. angularis* to culture silver barb, *Hypsibarbus malcolmi* (Smith), a Laotian  
113 indigenous cyprinid. The larvae were fed with an increasing number of *B. angularis* at 5-10 ind/ml

114 starting from hatching to day 12, and growth and survival were compared to those without feeding. After  
115 12 days of culture, survival was 100% with food, while none survived in without food treatment.  
116 Rotifer-fed larvae also grew from 2.8 mm to 5.8 mm, proving that rotifer supported the growth of silver  
117 barb larvae. After confirming that *B. angularis* is useful for rearing *H. malcolmi* larvae, Ogata (2017)  
118 conducted another experiment to compare *H. malcolmi* fed with *B. angularis*, *Artemia*, copepods, *Moina*  
119 spp., and catfish pellets from 2 days after hatching (2DAH) to 28DAH with *H. malcolmi* fed with mixed  
120 natural zooplankton collected from an aquaculture pond. Results showed that the first group and second  
121 group have 94% and 6% survival rate on 28DAH, respectively, and there is a large variation in total  
122 length of the survivors in the second group, while the first group grew from 2.8 mm to 15.2 mm at  
123 28DAH.

124 Ogata & Kurokura (2012) tested *B. angularis*, paramecium *Paramecia* sp., and *Artemia* as live  
125 food sources for Siamese fighting fish, *Betta splendens* Regan. Larviculture of *B. splendens* is presently  
126 done by feeding protozoans. Their results showed that survival (97.5–100%) was high in all fed  
127 treatments. The fastest growth rate was observed in larvae fed a combination of rotifer and *Artemia*,  
128 wherein growth increased by 282% by 18 DAH relative to 3 DAH. The next fastest growth rate was  
129 observed in rotifer-fed larvae and then in paramecia-fed larvae with 158% increase and 54.3% increase  
130 in growth, respectively.

131 In 2016, we had isolated *B. angularis* from a pond in Kegati, Kenya. The size of the lorica (length  
132 =  $85.6 \pm 3.1 \mu\text{m}$ ; width =  $75.4 \pm 3.6 \mu\text{m}$ ) is slightly smaller to that found in Laos (Ogello et al., 2016).  
133 The optimum conditions for culturing this species were at 25°C and fed  $2.5 \times 10^6$  cells/ml *C. vulgaris*.  
134 Under these conditions, the net reproductive rate and intrinsic rate of natural increase ( $r$ ) were  $8.43 \pm 0.24$   
135 and  $0.74 \pm 0.02$ / day, respectively. Under mass culture (300 ml total volume) and optimum culture  
136 conditions, the highest population of  $255.6 \pm 12.6$  ind/ml was obtained (Ogello et al., 2016). We also  
137 found that addition of chicken manure at 2.0 ml/l enhances the population growth of this strain (Ogello &  
138 Hagiwara, 2015).

139 In China, Hu & Xi (2006, 2008) found that different strains of *B. angularis* isolated from  
140 different provinces within the country vary in size and life history parameters (generation time,  $r$ , and life  
141 span) and are influenced by food they consumed. Rotifers fed *Scenedesmus obliquus* (Turpin)  
142 Kützing had higher reproduction rates than those fed *Chlorella pyrenoidosa* H. Chick. As is known in *B.*  
143 *plicatilis* species complex (Hagiwara et al., 1995, 2001; Mills et al., 2017), *B. angularis* strains with  
144 smaller size show higher population growth even though their net reproduction rates are similar. The  $r$   
145 and net reproductive rates of these strains fed *S. obliquus* were 0.059-0.115 per hour and 13.38-16.35,  
146 respectively.

## 147 2) *Brachionus calyciflorus*

148 *Brachionus calyciflorus* Pallas is one of the widely studied freshwater rotifer with ubiquitous  
149 distribution (Rico-Martinez & Dodson, 1992).

150 The lorica length of *B. calyciflorus* from different geographic region in China ranges from 187 to  
151 227  $\mu\text{m}$  with an average  $r$  of 0.84/day at 20-30°C (Xi et al., 2005). The net reproductive rate of the three  
152 strains collected from different regions varies according to temperature, and ranging from 10-27 ind/ml  
153 (Xi et al., 2005). In Mexico, Rico-Martinez & Dodson (1992) found that the optimum culture conditions  
154 of *B. calyciflorus* isolated from a fish pond were at 30°C and fed  $10^7$  cells/ml *C. vulgaris*. Under these  
155 culture conditions, and at a volume of 500 ml, they were able to produce 81,080 rotifers/day. Bennett &  
156 Boraas (1988) was able to maintain *B. calyciflorus* in a turbidostat for eight months with maximum  
157 specific growth rate of 0.08/h which is equivalent to a doubling time of 8.7h.

158 Some studies have shown that animal and human excreta can promote *B. calyciflorus* growth. For  
159 example, Agbakimi et al. (2017) found that *B. calyciflorus* reared with cow dung and chicken droppings  
160 can reach 217 ind/ml after 5 days of culture. Dahril (1997) also showed that *B. calyciflorus* can grow up  
161 to 120 ind/ml using low concentrations of human and animal excreta including humans, chicken, duck,  
162 quail, horse, and buffalo by promoting the growth of *Chlorella*, which in turn serves as food for *B.*



163 *calyciflorus*. Under intensive culture, Park et al. (2001) conducted a batch culture (5-li vessel)  
164 experiments on *B. calyciflorus* at 28°C, feeding with freshwater *Chlorella* and supplied with pure oxygen.  
165 With these conditions, a maximum density of 19,200 ind/ml was reached, in contrast to 8,600 ind/ml  
166 obtained when usual aeration is supplied. They improved their system further by adjusting the pH of the  
167 culture water. At pH 7.0 and at 32°C with a continuous oxygen supply, a density of 33,500 ind/ml was  
168 obtained (Park et al., 2001).

169         There are considerable reports on the success and high growth rate of fish larvae when using *B.*  
170 *calyciflorus* as live food. For example, Lim & Wong (1997) showed that Dwarf gourami, *Colisa lalia*  
171 larvae (2-12 DAH), have higher growth and survival compared to those fed with egg yolk. At  
172 metamorphosis, the overall survival rate of larvae fed rotifers (65.1-74.4%) was about four times of those  
173 cultured in an open pond (17.5%). Similarly, Lim & Wong (1997) successfully cultured larvae of Brown  
174 discus, *Symphysodon aequifasciata axelrodi* L. P. Schultz using *B. calyciflorus*. Larviculture of Brown  
175 discus is usually done by rearing them together with their parents, where the larvae are eating body slime  
176 of the parents (called “parental feeding”) during the first two weeks of endogenous feeding (Lim &  
177 Wong, 1997). Results of their study showed that growth and survival rate of Brown discus fed on rotifers  
178 and parental feeding were comparable. Feeding solely with rotifer is advantageous because it eliminates  
179 the risk of the larvae to be eaten by the parental fish. The use of *B. calyciflorus* is also reported on  
180 zebrafish *Danio rerio* (Aoyama et al., 2015). Zebrafish larviculture was previously done by feeding  
181 marine rotifer *B. plicatilis*, which either or both rotifer or fish experience salinity shock, resulting in  
182 mortality (Aoyama et al., 2015). Nandini & Sarma (2000) also found that mollies, *Poecilia sphenops*  
183 Valenciennes continuously fed on *B. calyciflorus* from day 5 to day 55 of culture. Harzevili et al. (2003)  
184 obtained significantly higher survival of *B. calyciflorus*-fed turbot *Lota lota* compared to *Artemia*-fed  
185 group. The survival is further enhanced in the presence of “green water” (*Chlorella* sp.). Awaiss et al.  
186 (1996) obtained 95.5% survival rate on gudgeon, *Gobio gobio* (Linnaeus) fed with *B. calyciflorus* versus

187 63.7% on dry diet, with the final weight 15.5 mg versus 10 mg. Awaiss et al. (1996) also successfully  
188 used *B. calyciflorus* to feed catfish *Clarias gariepinus* (Burchell) during the first week of larval feeding.

### 189 3) *Proales similis*

190 *Proales similis* de Beauchamp is one of the common rotifer in saline systems, and so far in many  
191 countries including Mexico and Japan. In 2004, our group isolated a *P. similis* in an estuary of Okinawa,  
192 Japan. This rotifer is small (body length =  $82.7 \pm 11 \mu\text{m}$ ; body width =  $40 \pm 6 \mu\text{m}$ ), which is 38% smaller  
193 and 60% narrower than the SS-type rotifer, *B. rotundiformis* (Wullur et al. 2009). We also found that this  
194 species is also illoricate, has high population growth rate, and has nutritional value that can be  
195 manipulated just like other rotifer species (Wullur et al., 2009; Hagiwara et al., 2014). Since we found  
196 that this species is a promising species for larviculture, we conducted experiments to mass culture and  
197 fish feeding experiments using this species.

198 Wullur et al. (2009) found a female *P. similis* that can produce 4.3-7.8 offspring during its 2.9-3.4  
199 day reproductive period. *P. similis* grew well at temperatures 25 to 35°C, salinities between 2 to 15 ppt  
200 and both *N. oculata* and *C. vulgaris* as feed. Under above conditions, the *r* is ranging between 0.68 to  
201 0.81/day, and a density of 250 to 1030 ind/ml can be obtained. In mass culture, starting from 25 ind/ml,  
202 the density can reach up to 2,400 ind/ml, with an average *r* of 0.42/day after 11 days was obtained.

203 We also observed that *P. similis* tends to stay at the bottom of the culture container. We  
204 hypothesized that if we increase the culture surface area of the container, then we can obtain more  
205 rotifers. Two containers, one with a total surface area of 2,240 cm<sup>2</sup> and the other with 507 cm<sup>2</sup> were  
206 tested. From an initial density of 1 ind/ml, we obtained a density of 2,840 ind/ml and 717 ind/ml on the 7<sup>th</sup>  
207 day of culture from 2,240 cm<sup>2</sup> and 507 cm<sup>2</sup> surface area, respectively (Hagiwara et al., personal  
208 communication). We are currently innovating a rotifer apartment-like culture container to provide wider  
209 spaces for *P. similis* to graze.

210 We also conducted an experiment to determine if bacteria coming from decomposing animal  
211 wastes could sustain *P. similis* culture as other rotifer species. Our results showed that addition of fish  
212 wastes (0.75 g/ml) is beneficial to *P. similis*. At initial stocking density of 53 ind/ml, a density as high  
213  $1,605 \pm 45$  ind/ml could be obtained on day 10 (Kagali et al., 2018). We hypothesized that *P. similis* uses  
214 micro-aggregates of organic materials present in the decomposing fish wastes to enhance probiotic  
215 bacterial bloom. Indeed, Le et al. (2017) showed that bacterial community is important in the proliferation  
216 of *P. similis*. The population density of *P. similis* with the addition of live mixture of bacteria was 755%  
217 higher than those fed with probiotics in the presence of antibiotic (Le et al., 2017). Although *P. similis* can  
218 thrive in the presence of some species of bacteria, the presence of protozoa in the culture water is  
219 detrimental to the culture (Hagiwara et al., personal communication). Therefore, it is necessary to provide  
220 clean and protozoa-free culture water to *P. similis*.

221 Several experiments to determine if aeration is necessary for the proliferation of *P. similis* were  
222 also conducted. Our studies showed that culture of *P. similis* starting from a 1 ind/ml can exponentially  
223 increase and be stable for up to 13 days, with a peak density of  $4,046 \pm 47$  ind/ml even without aeration;  
224 and a similar density with aeration (Hagiwara et al., personal communication).

225 Unlike the Japanese strain, the Mexican strain of *P. similis* is more resilient to high salinities.  
226 Reyes et al. (2017) found that *P. similis* isolated from a fish pond in Mexico can thrive at 5-35 ppt, with  
227 an  $r$  ranging from 0.46 to 0.51/day, and a duplication time ranging from 1.36 to 1.51 days. Although the  
228 maximum density at 35 ppt (1,703 ind/ml), was lower than that at 5-25 ppt (maximum values were  
229 between 2,488 to 2,560 ind/ml).

230 We also successfully tested the usefulness of *P. similis* to fish larvae with very small mouth gape  
231 including grouper, angelfish, and humphead wrasse as well as fish with complicated digested system such  
232 as eel (Wullur et al., 2009; Wullur et al., 2011; Hagiwara et al., 2014). So far, *P. similis* is one of the most  
233 promising smallest rotifer that can be used in culturing larvae that cannot accept SS-type rotifer.

234 **Potential rotifer species for larviculture**

235 In this review, we listed some of the non-*B. plicatilis* species complex with high potential for  
236 usage for larviculture based on their characteristics, life history and distribution. The summary of the life  
237 history of these rotifer species is presented in Table 2.

238 Chigbu & Suchar (2006) evaluated the possibility of culturing *Colurella dicentra* (Gosse) isolated  
239 from a Mississippi Gulf Coast estuary. The average lorica length of this species is 93  $\mu$ m and a width of  
240 49  $\mu$ m. They conducted experiments to determine the effects of salinity (10–47 ppt) on its population  
241 growth rate, fed with *N. oculata* at a density of 100,000 cells/ml. The culture duration is 15 days. Their  
242 results showed that *C. dicentra* survived in 10–47ppt. The best salinity to cultivate this species is at 15ppt,  
243 with an  $r$  ranging from 0.37–0.42/day, and the highest density was  $259 \pm 70$  ind/ml.

244 Another species potential for larviculture is *Keratella* sp. Lee et al. (2013) investigated the  
245 optimum salinity and temperature conditions for the mass culture of *Keratella* sp. The maximum density  
246 of 1,007 ind/ml was observed in freshwater or 0‰. Also the highest number of offspring per female  
247 (10.2) and lifespan of the female (10.7 days) were obtained at 0‰, but were not significantly different at  
248 5‰. In their temperature experiments (16–32°C), the highest maximum density (1,766 ind/ml) was  
249 observed at 24°C. The number of offspring per female significantly increased with increasing temperature,  
250 and the highest number of offspring per female was 10.4 individual. At 24°C, the lifespan of female  
251 increased with decreasing temperature, with the longest lifespan lasting 12.8 days.

252 With the aim of using rotifer in larval rearing of catfish in Nigeria, Ajah (2010) conducted a mass  
253 culture experiment on local rotifer species, the *Brachionus quadridentatus* Hermann. Result of his study  
254 showed that best food for this species is *Scenedesmus quadricauda* (Turpin). Using 3m<sup>3</sup> concrete tank,  
255 he was able to maintain the culture for two years, with the density of 176,000 ind/l. The doubling time is  
256 at the average of 20 h.

257           Oltra et al. (2000) also conducted series of studies to mass culture a marine rotifer *Synchaeta*  
258 *cecilia valentina* Oltra & Todolí, a species ubiquitously found in Spain. Under culture conditions of  
259 24°C, 20-37 ppt, and fed *Tetraselmis* sp., this species can reach up to 4,800 ind/l. The fatty acid content  
260 of this species is similar to those of *B. plicatilis* when given *Tetraselmis* species (both *Tetraselmis* sp., and  
261 *Tetraselmis chuii* Butcher) as food at a concentration of 5.55 µg/ml dry weight.

262           Farhadian et al. (2013) studied the population growth and production of the freshwater rotifer,  
263 *Euchlanis dilatata* Ehrenberg fed different microalgal food with the addition of alfalfa (*Medicago* spp.)  
264 meal. The highest density they attained with this species is 255 ind/ml in treatment fed with *Scenedesmus*  
265 *quadricauda* and alfalfa meal. The mean population growth rate is also high (0.58/d) in this treatment  
266 which is not significantly different from those fed with *C. vulgaris* (0.59/d).

#### 267 **Factors affecting predation of rotifers**

268           Although rotifers are superior among live food, rotifers possess defensive structures *e.g.* long  
269 spines, and have the capability to adjust their morphology and behavior to prevent predation (Gilbert,  
270 2014; Yin et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2017 Xue et al., 2017). For example, Yin et al. (2017) found that *B.*  
271 *angularis* increased lorica thickness and enhanced lorica hardness in the presence of the predator  
272 *Asplanchna brightwellii* Gosse, while *B. calyciflorus* developed longer posterolateral spines and increased  
273 in body size within the presence of the same predator. Gilbert (2014) found that *Brachionus variabilis*  
274 Hempel when cultured with *Asplanchna girodi* Guerne have larger (13%) lorica, longer (30-40%) anterior  
275 spines, and longer (150%) posterior spine. *B. calyciflorus*, which originated from different environments  
276 in China, developed stable long posterior lateral spines and smaller body size in the presence of predators  
277 including fish, copepods and *Asplanchna* (Xue et al., 2017). Rotifer *Keratella cochlearis* (Gosse) is  
278 somewhat special in which they are known to have bi-directional change in spine length, depending on  
279 the size of the predator (Zhang et al., 2017). Zhang et al. (2017) both on laboratory and field studies  
280 showed that, in the presence of larger predators, *K. cochlearis* shortened or reduced their spine length and

281 then elongated it in the presence of small-sized predators. In the case of fish as the predator, our group  
282 found that the swimming speed of rotifer *B. plicatilis* is significantly faster (0.49 vs. 0.58 mm/sec) when  
283 cultured in a culture medium with the seven band grouper *Epinephelus semtemfasciatus* (Thunberg) as the  
284 predator. In addition, Alanis et al. (2009) found that the larvae of red-eyed tetra, *Moenkhausia*  
285 *sanctaefilomenae* (Steindachner) prefers to prey on *Brachionus rubens* (Ehrenberg) and *B. calyciflorus*  
286 which has shorter spines (about 10  $\mu\text{m}$ ) than *Brachionus havanaensis* Rousselet and *Brachionus patulus*  
287 Varga, which have longer spines.

## 288 **Acknowledgement**

289 This research was supported by JSPS KAKENHI Grant Number JP17H03862 to Atsushi  
290 Hagiwara.

## 291 **References**

- 292 Agbakimi, I.O., F.O. Arimoro, A.V. Ayanwale, U.N. Keke, J. Gana & J. Abafi, 2017. Mass culture and  
293 growth response of rotifer (*Brachionus calyciflorus*) fed different combinations of manure filtrates and  
294 algae. International Journal of Applied Biological Research 81: 70-84.
- 295 Ajah, P.O, 2010. Mass culture of rotifer (*Brachionus quadridentatus* [Hermann, 1783]) using three  
296 different algal species. African Journal of Food Science 4: 80-85.
- 297 Alanis, J.G., S.S.S. Sarma, & S. Nandini, 2009. Prey selectivity and functional response by larval red  
298 eyed tetra *Moenkhausia sanctaefilomenae* (Steindachner, 1907) (Characiformes: Characidae). Brazilian  
299 Archives of Biology and Technology 52: 1209-1216.
- 300 Aoyama, Y., N. Moriya, S. Tanaka, T. Taniguchi, H. Hosokawa, & S. Maegawa, 2015. A novel method  
301 for rearing zebrafish by using freshwater rotifers (*Brachionus calyciflorus*). Zebrafish 12: 288-295.

302 Awaiss, A., P. Kestermonth & J.C. Micha, 1996. Fatty acid profiles of two freshwater fish larvae  
303 (gudgeon and perch) reared with *Brachionus calyciflorus* Pallas (rotifer) and/or dry diet. *Aquaculture*  
304 *Research* 27: 651-658.

305 Bennett, W.N & M. E. Boraas, 1988. Isolation of a fast-growing strain of the rotifer *Brachionus*  
306 *calyciflorus* Pallas using turbidostat culture. *Aquaculture* 73: 27-36.

307 Chigbu, P. & V.A. Suchar, 2006. Isolation and culture of the marine rotifer, *Colurella dicentra* (Gosse,  
308 1887), from a Mississippi Gulf Coast estuary. *Aquaculture Research* 37: 1400-1405.

309 Conceição L.E.C., M. Yúfera, P. Makridis, S. Morais & M.T. Dinis, 2010. Live feeds for early stages of  
310 fish rearing. *Aquaculture Research* 41: 613-640.

311 Dahril, T., 1997. A study of the freshwater rotifer *Brachionus calyciflorus* in Pekanbaru, Riau, Indonesia.  
312 *Hydrobiologia* 358: 211–215.

313 Dhert, P., G. Rombaut, G. Suantika & P. Sorgeloos, 2001. Advancement of rotifer culture and  
314 manipulation techniques in Europe. *Aquaculture* 200: 129–146.

315 FAO, 2016. The state of world fisheries and aquaculture; contributing to food security and nutrition for  
316 all. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, Rome, pp. 200.

317 Farhadian, O., L. Daghighi & E. E. Dorche, 2013. Effects of microalgae and alfalfa meal on population  
318 growth and production of a freshwater rotifer *Euchlanis dilatata* (Rotifera: Monogononta). *Journal of*  
319 *World Aquaculture Society* 44: 86-95.

320 Gilbert, J.J., 2014. Morphological and behavioral responses of a rotifer to the predator *Asplanchna*.  
321 *Journal of Plankton Research* 36: 1576-1584.

322 Hagiwara, A., C.-S. Lee, G. Miyamoto & A. Hino, 1989. Resting egg formation and hatching of the S-  
323 type rotifer *Brachionus plicatilis* at varying salinities. *Marine Biology* 103: 327-332.

324 Hagiwara, A., K. Hamada, A. Nishi, K. Imaizumi & K. Hirayama, 1993 Mass production of  
325 rotifer *Brachionus plicatilis* resting eggs in 50m<sup>3</sup> tanks. Nippon Suisan Gakkaishi 59: 93-98.

326 Hagiwara, A., Kotani, T., Snell, T. W., AssavaAree, M. & K. Hirayama, 1995a. Morphology,  
327 reproduction and genetics of the tropical minute marine rotifer *Brachionus plicatilis* strains. Journal of  
328 Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 194: 25-37.

329 Hagiwara, A., M. Jung, T. Sato & K. Hirayama, 1995b. Interspecific interaction between marine rotifer  
330 *Brachionus plicatilis* and zooplankton species found in the rotifer mass culture tanks as  
331 contaminants. Fisheries Science 61: 623-627.

332 Hagiwara, A., Gallardo, W. G., Assavaaree, M., Kotani, T. & A. B. de Araujo, 2001. Live food  
333 production in Japan: recent progress and future aspects. Aquaculture 200: 111-127.

334 Hagiwara, A., K. Suga, A. Akazawa, T. Kotani & Y. Sakakura, 2007. Development of rotifer strains with  
335 useful traits for rearing fish larvae. Aquaculture 268: 44-52.

336 Hagiwara, A., S. Wullur, H.S. Marcial, N. Hirai & Y. Sakakura, 2014. Euryhaline rotifer *Proales similis*  
337 as initial live food for rearing fish with small mouth. Aquaculture 432: 470-474.

338 Hagiwara, A., H-J. Kim & H. Marcial, 2017. Mass culture and preservation of *Brachionus plicatilis* sp.  
339 complex. In Hagiwara, A & T. Yoshinaga (eds), Rotifers: Aquaculture, Ecology, Gerontology, and  
340 Ecotoxicology. Springer, Singapore: 35-55.

341 Harzevili, A.S., D. de Charlero, J. Auwerx, J. Van Slycken, P. Dhert & P. Sorgeloos, 2003. Larval  
342 rearing of burbot (*Lota lota* L.) using *Brachionus calyciflorus* rotifer as starter food. Journal of Applied  
343 Ichthyology 19: 84-87.

344 Hirai N, M. Koiso, K. Teruya, M. Kobayashi, T. Takebe, T. Sato, K. Okuzawa & A. Hagiwara, 2012.  
345 Success of seed production of humphead wrasse *Cheilinus undulatus* with improvement of spawning



346 induction, feeding and rearing conditions. Proceedings of the 40th U.S.-Japan Aquaculture Panel  
347 Symposium, Honolulu, Hawaii pp.108-111.

348 Hu, H. & Y. Xi, 2006. Differences in population growth and morphometric characteristics of three strains  
349 of *Brachionus angularis*. Journal of Freshwater Ecology 21: 101-108.

350 Hu, H. & Y. Xi, 2008. Demographic parameters and mixis of three *Brachionus angularis* Gosse  
351 (Rotatoria) strains fed on different algae. Limnologica 38: 56–62.

352 Hwang, D.-S., H.-U. Dahms, H. G. Park & J.-S. Lee, 2013. A new intertidal *Brachionus* and intrageneric  
353 phylogenetic relationships among *Brachionus* as revealed by allometry and CO1-ITS1 gene analysis.  
354 Zoological Studies 52: 13.

355 Kagali, R.N., E.O. Ogello, Y. Sakakura & A. Hagiwara, 2018. Fish-processing wastes as an alternative  
356 diet for culturing the minute rotifer *Proales similis* de Beauchamp. Aquaculture Research 49: 2477-2485.

357 Le, D.V.B., P.N. Nguyen, K. Dierckens, D.V. Nguyen, P. De Schryver, A. Hagiwara & P. Bossier, 2017.  
358 Growth performance of the very small rotifer *Proales similis* is more dependent on proliferating bacterial  
359 community than the bigger rotifer *Brachionus rotundiformis*. Aquaculture 476: 185-193.

360 Lee, B.I., S.K Kim, O.N. Kwon, H.G. Park & J.C. Park, 2013. The optimal salinity and temperature  
361 condition for the growth of rotifer, *Keratella* sp. (in Korean with English abstract). Journal of Fisheries  
362 and Marine Education 25: 1205-1213.

363 Lim, L.C. & C.C. Wong, 1997. Use of the rotifer, *Brachionus calyciflorus* Pallas, in freshwater  
364 ornamental fish larviculture. Hydrobiologia 358: 269–273.

365 Lim, L.C., P. Dhert & P. Sorgeloos, 2003. Recent developments in the application of live feeds in the  
366 freshwater ornamental fish culture. Aquaculture 227: 319-33.

367 Lubzenz, E., 1987. Raising rotifers for use in aquaculture. Hydrobiologia 147: 245-255.

368 Majoris, J.E., F.A. Francisco, J. Atema & P.M. Buston, 2018. Reproduction, early development, and  
369 larval rearing strategies for two sponge-dwelling neon gobies, *Elacatinus lori* and *E. Colini*. *Aquaculture*  
370 483: 286-295.

371 Mills, S., A. Alcántara-Rodríguez, J. Ciros-Pérez, A. Gómez, A. Hagiwara, K.H. Galindo, C.D. Jersabek,  
372 R. Malekzadeh-Viayeh, F. Leasi, J-S. Lee, D.B. Mark Welch, S. Papakostas, S. Riss, H. Segers, M. Serra,  
373 R. Shiel, R. Smolak, T.W. Snell, C-P. Stelzer, C.Q. Tang, R.L. Wallace, D. Fontaneto, E.J. Walsh, 2017.  
374 Fifteen species in one: deciphering the *Brachionus plicatilis* species complex (Rotifera, Monogononta)  
375 through DNA taxonomy. *Hydrobiologia* 796: 39-58.

376 Nandini, S. & S.S.S. Sarma, 2000. Zooplankton preference of two species of freshwater ornamental fish  
377 larvae. *Journal of Applied Ichthyology* 16: 282-284.

378 Ogata, Y., 2017. Use of freshwater *Brachionus* for aquaculture. In Hagiwara, A & T. Yoshinaga (eds),  
379 Rotifers: Aquaculture, Ecology, Gerontology, and Ecotoxicology. Springer, Singapore: 75-85.

380 Ogata, Y., & H. Kurokura, 2012. Use of the freshwater *Brachionus angularis* as the first food for the  
381 larvae of the Siamese fighting fish *Betta splendens*. *Fisheries Science* 78: 109-125.

382 Ogata, Y., Y. Tokue, T. Yoshikawa, A. Hagiwara, & H. Kurokura, 2011. A Laotian strain of the rotifer  
383 *Brachionus angularis* holds promise as a food source for small-mouthed larvae of freshwater fish in  
384 aquaculture. *Aquaculture* 312: 72-76.

385 Ogello, E.O. & A. Hagiwara, 2015. Effects of chicken manure extract on the population growth, mixis  
386 induction and body size of the freshwater rotifer *Brachionus angularis* Gosse 1851. *Asian Fisheries*  
387 *Science* 28: 174-185.

388 Ogello, E.O., H-J. Kim, K. Suga & A. Hagiwara, 2016. Lifetable demography and population growth of  
389 the rotifer *Brachionus angularis* in Kenya: influence of temperature and food density. *African Journal of*  
390 *Aquatic Science* 41: 329-336.

391 Oltra, R., R. Todoli, T. Bosque, L.M. Lubian & J.C. Navarro, 2000. Life history and fatty acid  
392 composition of the marine rotifer *Synchaeta cecilia valentina* fed different algae. Marine Ecology  
393 Progress Series 193: 125-133.

394 Park, H.G., K.W. Lee, S.H. Cho, H.S. Kim, M-M. Jung & H-S. Kim, 2001. High density culture of the  
395 freshwater rotifer, *Brachionus calyciflorus*. Hydrobiologia 446/447: 369-374.

396 Reyes, J.R.C., C. J. L. Monteón, H. C. Urreta, M. C. M. Dosta & G. A. R. Montes de Oca, 2017.  
397 Population growth and protein and energy content of *Proales similis* (Rotifera: Monogononta) reared at  
398 different salinities. Turkish Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences 17: 767-775.

399 Rico-Martinez, R. & S.I. Dodson, 1992. Culture of the rotifer *Brachionus calyciflorus* Pallas.  
400 Aquaculture 105: 191-199.

401 Sakakura, Y., 2017. Application of rotifers for larval rearing of marine fishes cultivated under various  
402 conditions. In Hagiwara, A & T. Yoshinaga (eds), Rotifers: Aquaculture, Ecology, Gerontology, and  
403 Ecotoxicology. Springer, Singapore: 63-73.

404 Suchar, V. A. & P. Chigbu, 2006. The effects of algae species and densities on the population growth of  
405 the marine rotifer, *Colurella dicentra*. Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology 337: 96–  
406 102.

407 Whittington, R.J. & R. Chong. 2007. Global trade in ornamental fish from an Australian perspective: The  
408 case for revised import risk analysis and management strategies. Preventive Veterinary Medicine 81: 92-  
409 116.

410 Wullur, S., Y. Sakakura, & A. Hagiwara, 2009. The minute monogonont rotifer *Proales similis* de  
411 Beauchamp: culture and feeding to small mouth marine fish larvae. Aquaculture 293: 62-67.

412 Wullur, S., Y. Sakakura, & A. Hagiwara, 2011. Application of the minute monogonont rotifer *Proales*  
413 *similis* de Beauchamp in larval rearing of seven-band grouper *Epinephelus septemfasciatus*. *Aquaculture*  
414 315: 355–360.

415 Xi, Y-L., Y-L. Ge, F. Chen, X-L. Wen & L-L. Dong, 2005. Life history characteristics of three strains of  
416 *Brachionus calyciflorus* (Rotifera) at different temperatures. *Journal of Freshwater Ecology* 20: 707-713.

417 Xue, Y-H., X-X. Yang, G. Zhang & Y-L. Xi, 2017. Morphological differentiation of *Brachionus*  
418 *calyciflorus* caused by predation and coal ash pollution. *Scientific Reports* 7: 15779.  
419 DOI:10.1038/s41598-017-16192.

420 Yin X., W. Jin, Y. Zhou, P. Wang & W. Zhao, 2017. Hidden defensive morphology in rotifers: benefits,  
421 costs, and fitness consequences. *Scientific Reports* 7: 4488/DOI: 10254/DOI: 10.1038/s41598-08772-7.

422 Yoshimatsu, T. & M. A. Hossain, 2014. Recent advances in the high-density rotifer culture in Japan.  
423 *Aquaculture International* 22: 1587-1603.

424 Yoshimura, K., K. Tanaka & T. Yoshimatsu, 2003. A novel system for the ultra-high-density production  
425 of the rotifer, *Brachionus rotundiformis*- a preliminary report. *Aquaculture* 227: 165-172.

426 Zhang, H., J. Hollander & L-A. Hansson, 2017. Bi-directional plasticity: Rotifer prey adjust spine length  
427 to different predator regimes. *Scientific Reports* 7: 10254/DOI: 10.1038/s41598-08772-7.

Table 1. Characteristics of rotifer species commonly used in larviculture

Species	Size of egg bearing females ( $\mu\text{m}$ )	Reproductive characteristics	Reference (Food, temperature, salinity)
<i>Brachionus plicatilis</i> species complex			
<i>Brachionus plicatilis</i>	Lorica length = 325 $\pm$ 24	$r = 0.29 - 0.31$ Highest density = 425 ind/ml	Hagiwara et al. (1993, 2007) ( <i>Nannochloropsis oculata</i> and baker's yeast, 18-21 °C, 10-15 ppt)
<i>Brachionus koreanus</i>	Lorica length = 192 - 213	$r = 0.57 - 0.64$ Highest density = 950 ind/ml  Highest density = 160,000 ind/ml	Hagiwara et al. (1989); Hwang et al. (2013) ( <i>Tetraselmis tetrathele</i> , 25.5 - 34 °C, 8 -32 ppt)  Yoshimura et al. (2003) ; Yoshimatsu & Hossain (2014) ( <i>Chlorella vulgaris</i> , 32 °C, 33 - 35 ppt)
<i>Brachionus rotundiformis</i>	Lorica length = 187 $\pm$ 5	$r = 0.23 - 1.57$ Highest density =3,500 ind/ml	Hagiwara et al. (1995a, b) ( <i>N. oculata</i> , 25 - 35 °C, 11 - 34 ppt )
<i>Brachionus angularis</i>	Lorica length = 86.0 $\pm$ 4.9	Highest density =3,500 ind/ml	Ogata et al., 2011; Ogata, 2017 ( <i>C. vulgaris</i> , 24 - 27°C)
	Lorica length = 85.6 $\pm$ 3.1	$r = 0.41-0.74$ Ro = 4.7- 6.3 Highest density = 256 ind/ml	Ogello et al., 2016 ( <i>C. vulgaris</i> , 20-30°C)
	Body size = 2.7 - 4.8 ( $\times 10^5 \mu\text{m}^3$ )	$r (h) = 0.06-0.12$ Ro = 13.4 - 16.4	Hu & Xi, 2006, 2008 ( <i>Scenedesmus obliquus</i> , 25 °C)

<i>Brachionus calyciflorus</i>	Lorica length = 231	$r = 1.04$	Park et al., 2001;
		Highest density = 33,500 ind/ml	( <i>C. vulgaris</i> , 32 °C)
		$r = 0.9 - 1.7$	Xi et al., 2005
		Ro = 22	( <i>S. obliquus</i> , 25 °C)
<i>Proales similis</i>	Body length = 83 ± 11	$r = 0.63 - 0.93$	Wullur et al., 2009;
		Highest density = 4,046 ind/ml	( <i>N. oculata</i> , <i>C. vulgaris</i> , 25–35 °C , 2-25 ppt)
		$r = 0.46 - 0.52$	Reyes et al., 2017
		Highest density = 1,703-2,560 ind/ml	( <i>N. oculata</i> , 25 °C, 5-35 ppt)
		Highest density = 1,605 ind/ml	Kagali et al., 2018 (Fish waste diet, 26 °C, 8 ppt, )

---

$r$  (/day) – intrinsic rate of natural increase; Ro-net reproductive rate

Table 2. Characteristics of rotifer species with potentials for use in larviculture

Species	Size ( $\mu\text{m}$ )	Reproductive characteristics	Reference (Food, temperature, salinity)
<i>Colurella dicentra</i>	Lorica length = 93 $\mu\text{m}$	$r = 0.37-0.42$ Highest density = 259 $\pm$ 70 ind/ml	Chigbu & Suchar, 2006 ( <i>N. oculata</i> , 21 - 24°C, 15 ppt)
<i>Keratella</i> sp.		$r = 0.75$ Ro = 10.4 Highest density = 1,766 ind/ml	Lee et al., 2013 ( <i>Tetraselmis suecica</i> , 24 °C, 0 - 34 ppt)
<i>Brachionus quadridentatus</i>		Doubling time = 20h Highest density = 17.6 ind/ml	Ajah, 2010 ( <i>Eudorina elegans</i> , 28 °C, 0 ppt)
<i>Syncheta cecilia valentina</i>		$r = 1.0$ Ro = 11.7	Oltra et al., 2000 ( <i>Tetraselmis</i> sp., 20°C, 25 ppt )
<i>Euchlanis dilatata</i>		$r = 0.58-0.59$ Highest density = 255 ind/ml	Farhadian et al., 2013 ( <i>Scenedesmus quadricauda</i> , and alfalfa meal, 25 °C, 0 ppt)

$r$  – intrinsic rate of natural increase; Ro-net reproductive rate